MINUTES

2013 Board of Equalization and Review

June 20, 2013

Board Members Present: Jane Sparks, Chair
Jennifer Marsh
Barbara Levine

Staff Members Present: Roger Gunn, Chief Appraiser
Steve Hensley, Appraiser
Scherri McCray, Recording Secretary

Ms. Sparks called the Board to order at 2:04 p.m. on Thursday June 20, 2013.

Audrey JW Barnwell *PIN #9823203815*

Mr. Barnwell elected not to appear before the Board to request consideration for his untimely appeal filing. His property is located at 2619 MEBANE OAKS ROAD, MEBANE. Mr. Barwell submitted a written request to have his appeal heard by the Board. He stated that he was not able to file his appeal before the Board's deadline adjournment date of May 23rd, 2013 and he is requesting that he be given the opportunity to appeal his property value before the Board.

After deliberation, Ms. Sparks made a motion not to hear the appeal. Mrs. Marsh seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Richard Covitz *PIN # 9865941073*

Mr. and Mrs. Covitz appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 210 WILLOWBEND LANE, HILLSBOROUGH. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is $ 386,000. They are requesting that the Board reduce the value to $ 304,500 citing that the County's assessment is not accurate because of the property's description and in light of the comparable sales they submitted for the Willowbend neighborhood. The Covitzs claim that the County based their valuation on properties located in the Churton Grove neighborhood and they feel that the properties are different and should not have been used to assess their property. They stated that properties in Churton Grove built by the same developer as Willowbend were built with superior quality and features and the quality and features of their home are lower standard. Mr. Covitz stated that the builders wanted to keep the cost of the homes in Willowbend under $ 300,000. Therefore, the Willowbend community does not have all of the amenities of Churton Grove. He noted that there are only fourteen homes in the subdivision and all are on less than .2 acre lots. Mr. Covitz stated that based on the information he obtained from the Orange County GIS website, the lot values in Churton Grove

were approximately $20,000 more than their property. Furthermore, he noted that the County has incorrect square footage for his home. He stated that the County's recorded square footage is off by 100 square feet.

The appellant provided additional sales that occurred before January 1, 2009 that he felt are more similar to his property than sales in Churton Grove. He also feels that the quality of construction of the homes in the Kenyon Grove subdivision is similar to his property's construction. The subject was built in 2012 and the appellants are the first owners.

Upon review, the County examined the building permit record for the appellant's property and noticed that the submitted cost for the building construction was $ 320,000. The appellant replied that the builder quoted him a cost of $ 194,000. The County informed the appellant that the 2009 schedule of values are used on properties even if those properties were built in 2012. The County noted that the construction grade for the subject was different than that of similar properties and recommended that it be changed to A+05 to make the subject equitable in quality with the other homes in the neighborhood. Also, the addition of a homesite value was needed for the land value and the square footage of the house needed to be corrected to 2,940 square feet.

During deliberation, the Board reviewed all documents presented by the appellant and the County. The Board noted that the appellant's property was one of the largest in the neighborhood. After deliberation, Mrs. Marsh made a motion to accept the recommendations made by the County. These adjustments will render a new value of $ 354,500 for the property. Ms. Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Stephen V Judd ***PIN # 9855952319***

Mr. and Mrs. Judd appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 606 FAUCETTE MILL ROAD, HILLSBOROUGH. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is $ 774,300. The appellants are requesting that their value be reduced to $ 580,000 based on a recent appraisal performed for refinancing when the appellants started preparation for an addition to their house. The Judds acknowledge that the 14 acre property is the Present Use Value program but they are appealing the value on the house. Mrs. Judd feels that the barn and equipment buildings should not be taxed at the same rate as the house. Furthermore, the Judds stated that the house only has 1.5 bathrooms, one true bedroom, and a loft area that serves as a bedroom. Ms. Judd did note that with the addition being added, they were increasing the living area approximately 2,000 square feet and adding a basement and a stable to the property. The appellant then provided information about the living area above the stable.

Upon review, the County recommended that the number of bedrooms be corrected to reflect only one bedroom and functional obsolescence of 30% added for the design/layout of the house. These recommendations would change the value to $ 608,846.

During deliberation, the Board reviewed all information provided by the appellant and the County. After deliberation, Ms. Sparks made a motion to accept the County's recommendations. Ms. Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Robert H Pope ***PIN # 9859019289***

Mr. & Mrs. Pope appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 6909 EFLAND-CEDAR GROVE ROAD, EFLAND. The current assessed value assigned to the property by Orange County is $ 318,380. The property is on the Orange County Historic Place registry. The appellants informed the Board that in 2004 they received a notice of value increase after the house had been recently painted. When an appeal for a value change to the Board of Equalization and Review in 2004 was denied, the appellants appealed to the Property Tax Commission at which time the Property Tax Commission ruled that the County correct the records to reflect changes to the property by correcting the foot print of the house to indicate the removal of former improvements, correct the value added due to new painting, and remove a record of a former mobile home.

Upon review, the County informed the Board and the appellant that there was a possibility that the information was added back due to a system error. The County recommended that they be able to conduct a field review to correct all of the measurements. In addition to the field review, the County recommended that the Board reduce the value of the home on the second parcel.

During deliberation, the Board reviewed all information that the appellant and the County presented. After deliberation, Mrs. Marsh made a motion to accept the County's recommendation of conducting a field review and making the necessary corrections to the records including correcting the condition and value of the second residence to reflect that it is used for storage. Staff is to bring back findings and results to the Board for a ruling. Ms. Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

FFF, LLC ***PIN # 9776487523***

J. Gordon Fisher appeared before the Board to appeal the value of his property located at Lot #14, DAIMLER DRIVE. This is a 1.95 acre vacant lot. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is $ 113,687. He is requesting that the Board reduce the value of this property citing the proposed building of a cell phone tower in front of his property will negatively impact the marketability and value of his property. He feels that experienced real estate agents are not interested in working with the property because of a very limited prospect market for a property with such a negative attribute. He claims that his property is the only lot that will be affected by this tower.

Upon review, the County stated that they were not able to access the property because there were no street signs to indicate the location. It is the County's recommendation that the site value be adjusted down 25% due to the effect on value of the planned tower. The adjustment would change the value of the property to $ 85,000.

The Board reviewed all documentation presented by the appellant and the County. Ms. Sparks made a motion to accept the County's recommendation. Ms. Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Matthew M Cook ***PIN # 9787353892***

Mr. Cook chose not to appear before the Board and requested to allow the appeal form and all supporting documentation to serve as his appeal. His property is located at 112 FOUNDERS RIDGE DRIVE, CHAPEL HILL. The current value assigned to the property by Orange County is $908,500. The appellant is requesting a reduction in value to $806,000 based on his purchase price of $805,950 in February 2013.

County staff provided comparable sales for 2007-2008, but the price range of these sales are quite varied.

Ms. Sparks made a motion for no change in value based on the fact that the only evidence provided by the appellant was an appraisal based on 2013 sales. Ms. Marsh seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Alejandro R Montero ***PIN # 9865612587***

Mr. Montero failed to appear before the Board for his scheduled appointment. His property is located at 107 MOLLIES COURT, HILLSBOROUGH. The current value assigned to the property by Orange County is $109,898.

Ms. Marsh made a motion for no change in value based on the fact that no evidence was submitted. Ms. Sparks seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Kamal Albarazanji *PIN # 9880567003.011*

Mr. Albarazanji chose not to appear before the Board and requested to allow the appeal form and all supporting documentation to serve as his appeal. His property is located at 123 KINGSBURY DRIVE, CHAPEL HILL. The current value assigned to the property by Orange County is $112,500. The appellant is requesting a reduction in value to $76,000 based on his purchase price in June 2012. He provided comparable sales, but the sales were post-revaluation and considered not relevant in time.

County staff provided that the average sales price for comparable homes in the subject neighborhood in 2008 was $113,500.

Ms. Levine made a motion that no change be made to the value due to the fact that the evidence provided was based on a foreclosure purchase price in June 2012 and that 2008 sales evidence provided by the County supported the County's valuation. Ms. Sparks seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Joseph F Rosemond Jr *PIN #9863846979*

Mr. Rosemond appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 2602 HOOPER COURT, HILLSBOROUGH. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is $272,300. The appellant is appealing the valuation based on two previous appraisals dated September 2012 and December 2003. Furthermore, he claims that there are two other properties in his neighborhood with identical plans that are assessed $10,000 less than his home. Mr. Rosemond also added that the square footage of his home is incorrect; it is overstated by 100 square feet. The appellant stated that the other homes that have the same plan have values of $263,600 but have a larger lot sizes. Mr. Rosemond does not feel that his property value is equitable with other similar properties and that the value of his property should be $260,000-$265,000

County staff previously made a site visit and re-measured the appellant's house. The house had less square footage than was on record. The record has been reviewed and already corrected for this year.

Ms. Marsh made a motion for no change to value as the difference in square footage and value estimates between Mr. Rosemond and The County are considered within an acceptable range. Ms. Sparks seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Shubin Liu *PIN # 9890231676*

Mr. Liu chose not to appear before the Board and requested to allow the appeal form and all supporting documentation to serve as his appeal. His property is located at 105 TELLURIDE TRAIL, CHAPEL HILL. The current value assigned to the property by Orange County is $851,724. Mr. Liu stated that an appropriate value for this property is $765,000.

County staff stated that the sketch for Mr. Liu's home was incorrect due to a sketching limitation of the County's previous assessment software. The County's current assessment software program provided for the sketch to be corrected. Based on the corrections, the assessed value would be changed to $838,900.

Ms. Marsh made a motion to accept the County recommendation to lower the value based on the correction of the sketch. Ms. Levine seconded the motion, and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Darlene H Euliss *PIN # 9827426181*

Ms. Euliss appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 8200 MCARTHER PARK DRIVE, EFLAND. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is $177,800. Ms. Euliss paid $133,000 for the property in November 2012. She provided a copy of an appraisal from November 2012 that gave an appraised value of $153,000 and provided comparable sales from 2012. She does not have any evidence for the relevant time frame preceding the revaluation. Ms. Euliss stated that nevertheless, her taxes are too high and that her house is modular construction.

County staff recommended that the living area be corrected to 1,620 square feet based on a re-sketch of the layout of the home including a correction to reflect a 1 ½ story home. The corrections would change the value minimally to $177,700.

Ms. Marsh motioned to accept the changes recommended by the County. Ms. Sparks seconded the motion, and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Travis B Hobbs *PIN # 9890605507.078*

Mr. Hobbs chose not to appear before the Board and requested to allow the appeal form and all supporting documentation to serve as his appeal. His property is located at 721 PROVIDENCE GLEN DRIVE, CHAPEL HILL. The current value assigned to the property by Orange County is $192,679. Mr. Hobbs provided his settlement statement from June 2012 that showed the contract

sale price of $157,300. He also provided an appraisal from May 2012 that showed the same value and comparable sales from the 2011-2012.

County staff pointed out that the evidence provided was not time relevant having occurred post-revaluation.

Ms. Marsh made a motion for no change in value because no time relevant information was provided to support a change in value. Ms. Levine seconded the motion, and the motion carried.

Ayes 3
Noes 0

Maya Styner ***PIN # 9799455321***

Mr. Styner submitted to the Board a written request for consideration of his untimely filed appeal. His property is located at 2619 MEBANE OAKS ROAD, MEBANE. Mr. Styner stated that he was not able to file his appeal before the Board's deadline adjournment date of May 23rd, 2013 and he is requesting that he be given the opportunity to appeal his property value before the Board.

After deliberation, Ms. Sparks made a motion not to hear the appeal. Mrs. Marsh seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Having heard all the appeals scheduled on this date, Ms. Sparks made a motion to adjourn this meeting. Ms. Merritt seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 5:00pm.

Jane Sparks, Chair

Scherri McCray, Recording Secretary