

MINUTES
Board of Equalization and Review
June 12, 2009

Board Members Present: Jane Sparks, Chair
Jerry Kruter
Barbara Levine

Staff Members Present: John Smith, Assessor
Judy Ryan, Deputy Assessor
Steve Hensley, Staff Appraiser
Pam Bryant, Recording Secretary

Ms. Sparks called the meeting to order at 1:12 p.m. on Friday, June 12, 2009.

Tate Construction & Realty Co., Inc. **701611**

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 118 Eugene St., Carrboro, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$42,169. This is a vacant lot and the appellant's are appealing the value due to the fact that the lot has a very steep topography.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to add a land adjustment of A-60 due to the topography. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Abundant Life Center of Chapel Hill, Inc. **714276**

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 8013 Rogers Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$274,830. This property is a 1.18 acre parcel improved with a 2137 square foot single family dwelling. Per the appellant, this house is a rental property. The house was built in 1997, has 3 bedrooms and 2.5 baths. There are two power line easements that pass through the lot.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to add a land adjustment of A-05 to the land value due to the proximity of the power lines. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

George Tate, Jr. Heirs

Ms. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of 10 unimproved parcels of land located off of Trice Atwater Road, Chapel Hill, NC. According to Ms. Tate, there is no formal access to the properties and a Duke Power easement crosses several of the lots. Below is a chart showing the tract numbers of each property, their size and 2009 Orange County valuation.

Tract #	Size	Orange Co. Valuation
601108	4.65	\$52,233
601109	4.65	\$52,233
601110	4.65	\$52,233
601111	4.65	\$52,233
601113	4.65	\$52,233
601115	4.65	\$52,233
601114	4.65	\$52,233
601108	4.65	\$52,233
601117	4.65	\$52,233
601118	4.65	\$52,233

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellants. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to change the land adjustment from A-10 to A-50 for poor legal access and lack of infrastructure. Also to be changed for the same reason, are Tracts 601119 and 601112. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Esther Tate & Abundant Life Center of Chapel Hill 700822

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of an unimproved lot located on W. Rosemary Street & Mitchell, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$450,561. This lot is an unpaved parking lot used by the employees of Tate Construction Co. & Realty, Inc.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Tate Construction & Realty Co., Inc. 705399

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of an unimproved lot on W. Rosemary Street, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$156,854. This lot is a vacant lot.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Esther W. Tate 727785

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of an unimproved lot on Union Grove Church Road, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$151.00.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Esther W. Tate 734560

Mrs. Esther Tate and her son appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of Mrs. Tate's primary residence located at 450 Piney Mountain Road, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$514,028. There is an old trailer on the property used for storage only.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Mario Poma 715187

Mr. Poma appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 112 Saddle Ridge Rd., Chapel Hill, Hillsborough, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$460,809. Mr. Poma is aware that the valuation of the property has been reduced during the informal appeal process from \$483,011 to \$460,809 and wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. Mr. Poma contends the home would need \$50,000 worth of repairs to make it marketable. The house has 2.5 baths, half the basement is finished, and there is brick veneer on the front of the house and siding on the rear.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to send a staff appraiser to do a site visit to determine the physical depreciation, take pictures, and check the basement finish. After the site visit this property should come back before the Board with the appraiser's determination for final deliberation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Louise Franke 256645

Ms. Franke and her real estate appraiser, Scott Dorsett, appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located in Hannah Creek Subdivision at 3200 Elizabeth Walters Rd., Efland, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$341,916. Ms. Franke is aware that the valuation was decreased from \$383,559 to \$341,916 during the informal appeal process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. Mr. Dorsett presented a market analysis and supporting documentation regarding a downturn in the real estate market. Mr. Dorsett believes the actual value of the property is somewhere between \$225,000 and \$230,000. The Franke's paid \$30,000 for the lot in 1995 and they built the home. The home was built to include a painting studio for Ms. Franke and according to Mr. Dorsett, the quality of construction is not as good as other homes in the area. The last two lots to sell in Hannah Creek Subdivision sold for \$25,000 each per Mr. Dorsett.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to change the grade from A-10 to B+10 and add a land adjustment of A-10 for size. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

NC Beta Foundation **706486**

Mr. Robert Page, representative for the NC Beta Foundation, appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of the property located at 210 N. Columbia Street, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$1,410,110. This fraternity house was built in 1925 and has always been used for this purpose. Per Mr. Page, the current zoning for the property is OI-2. The house was updated about 5± years ago at a cost of \$1,200,000. A sprinkler system was installed at that time, and the heating/air-conditioning and electrical were upgraded. The property receives \$94,000 of gross rent per year from the Beta Foundation. The fraternity house is approximately 12,000 SF with 4 baths.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Jane Sparks made a motion to increase the physical depreciation from 24% to 30%. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Richard Clark **702059**

Mr. Clark appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 612 Laurel Hill Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$541,377. The appellant purchased the home in 1987. Mr. Clark is aware that the valuation was decreased from \$551,024 to \$541,377 during the informal review process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. Mr. Clark presented photographs of his home along with a CMA completed by a local realtor with a value of \$412,100. Mr. Clark believes the noise from 15-501 Bypass factor diminishes the value of his property.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to add an economic depreciation factor of 15% and change the land adjustment from A-05 to A-20 for the noise factor. A comparable land adjustment should be made to Tract 705506 for the noise. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Betty Johnson **500487**

Ms. Johnson appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 3010 Plantation Ridge Ln., Mebane, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$166,004. Ms. Johnson purchased the property in March of 2008. The land size is 2.78 acres and the house needs a lot of repair. The appellant presented an appraisal dated February 2009 with a valuation of \$134,500. It was noted that the

property valuation was reduced during the informal appeals process from \$174,141 to \$166,004, but Ms. Johnson would like to continue the appeal for further reduction in the valuation.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks recused herself from voting as Ms. Johnson is an acquaintance. Jerry Kruter made a motion to increase the physical depreciation from 25% to 30%, change the grade from B-10 to B-15 and remove all value from the outbuildings. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 2

Noes: 0

Maxine Stern 248051

Ms. Stern appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 7405 Pentecost Rd., Cedar Grove, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$85,197. Ms. Stern purchased the property in June of 1997 at a purchase price of \$47,500. The house is a one-bedroom home built in 1924 with 736 square feet. The land is 2.47 acres in size and, per the owner, cannot be subdivided. The property is currently rented for \$400 per month.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Barbara Levine made a motion to increase the economic depreciation from 00 to 30% for one bedroom, change the grade from C+10 to C-05. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3

Noes: 0

Leon Todd 742468

Mr. Todd appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 1834 McLennan Farm Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$510,466. Mr. Todd believes his 2009 valuation is excessive compared to other homes in the neighborhood. Mr. Todd is aware that the valuation was decreased from \$519,349 to \$510,466 during the informal appeals process, but wishes to continue his appeal for further reduction in valuation.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Barbara Levine made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3

Noes: 0

Kent Goode **769954**

The appellant listed above failed to appear before the Board. Since the appellant presented no evidence, Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the value at this time. Should Mr. Goode request to reschedule prior to Board adjournment, his case can be reconsidered at that time. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried

Ayes: 3

Noes: 0

Having heard all the appeals scheduled on this date, Ms. Sparks made a motion to adjourn this meeting. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 5:15 pm.



Jane Sparks, Chair



Pamela Bryant, Recording Secretary