

MINUTES
Board of Equalization and Review
July 21, 2009

Board Members Present: Jane Sparks, Chair
Jerry Kruter
Barbara Levine

Staff Members Present: John Smith, Assessor
Judy Ryan, Deputy Assessor
Steve Hensley, Staff Appraiser
Pam Bryant, Recording Secretary

Ms. Sparks called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. on Tuesday, July 21, 2009. Jane Sparks made a motion to approve the minutes from May 29, June 4, June 5, and June 10, 2009. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

David & Julia Holmes 601978

Mr. and Mrs. Holmes appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of their property located at 2526 Overland Passage, Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$337,510. Mr. & Mrs. Holmes purchased the property in 2008 for \$300,000. The appellant's documentation included a CMA completed by a local appraiser, Scott Dorsett, on July 6, 2009 with an estimated market value of \$300,000.

Mr. & Mrs. Holmes did not have an appointment, and staff had not previously reviewed the documentation. Jane Sparks made a motion to table any decision on this property until staff has had time to review the documentation and bring back a recommendation to the Board for consideration. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Gordon Jameson 746566

Mr. Jameson appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 2608 Dairyland Rd., Hillsborough, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$347,024. Mr. Jameson purchased the property in 1994 for \$195,000. The property is a 4.85 acre tract improved with a 2044 square foot residence. The appellant's documentation included an appraisal completed May 2009 with an estimated market value of \$315,000.

Jerry Kruter is an acquaintance of Mr. Jameson and recused himself from the deliberation. During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that the county record be corrected by adding the pool, which was noted on the appraisal and the GIS system during deliberation. No further change should be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 2
Noes: 0

Gordon Jameson 723548

Mr. Jameson appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of a vacant 3.88 acre tract, which adjoins his primary residence at 2608 Dairyland Rd., Hillsborough, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$140,133. Mr. Jameson purchased the property in 2006 for \$150,000. The appellant's documentation included an appraisal completed May 2009 with an estimated market value of \$113,000. The septic system for Tract 746566 for his primary residence encroaches on this parcel.

Jerry Kruter is an acquaintance of Mr. Jameson and recused himself from the deliberation. During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 2
Noes: 0

Joe Stavas 767401

Mr. Stavas appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located in the Larkspur Subdivision at 103 Butterfield Ct., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$790,309. Mr. Stavas is aware that the valuation was adjusted downward from \$856,598 to \$790,309 during the informal appeal process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. Mr. Stavas purchased the property in 2004 for \$581,500. Per the appellant, there is an unfinished attic with permanent stairs, and a basement that is 60% finished.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to correct county records by changing the story height from 25 to 20 and making the attic finish "00". The finished basement area should be changed from 100% to 75%. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Judith Hauser 403458

Ms. Judith Hauser appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 511 Gwen Rd., Hillsborough, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$228,363. Ms. Hauser is aware that the valuation was adjusted downward from \$247,642 to \$228,363 during the informal appeal process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. Per the appellant, the house was built in 1975 and as of January 1, 2009 had the original bathrooms. Documentation included an appraisal completed May 2009 with an estimated market value of \$186,000. Ms. Hauser also included two CMAs completed by a local realtors with an suggested market value of below \$200 for the first, and the second giving a range of \$184,000-\$186,000. The appellant also presented photographs showing the condition of her home and deferred maintenance.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. The appraisal and CMAs along with sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to change the grade from B-05 to B-15 and to also change the physical depreciation from 28% to 35%. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3

Noes: 0

Rebecca Dirksen 771375

Ms. Dirksen appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 214 Glandon Dr., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$954,043. The property is a .33 acre lot improved with a 3586 square foot residence. Ms. Dirksen is aware that the valuation was adjusted downward from \$973,869 to \$954,043 during the informal appeal process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. The appellant purchased the home in 2007 for \$650,000 and has done extensive renovations. There is a basement area of approximately 1,000 square feet and permanent stairs. Documentation included an appraisal completed July 2009 with an estimated market value of \$820,000.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. The appraisal and sales of comparable properties were considered. Barbara Levine made a motion to correct the county record by changing the basement area from 100% to 50%, and changing the finished basement area from 50% to 100%. The basement area for building section B should be removed, and the design factor on building section A should also be removed. Jane Sparks seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3

Noes: 0

Arun Gupta 763009

Mr. Gupta appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 5007 Sweeten Creek Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$690,837. The property is a .55 acre lot improved with a 3841 square foot residence. Mr. Gupta is aware that the valuation was adjusted downward from \$699,194 to \$690,837 during the informal appeal process, but wishes to pursue further reduction in the valuation. The appellant purchased the home in 2008 for \$550,000. Mr. Gupta's primary concern was that he felt there is a disparity between his land value and the land values of neighboring properties. Documentation included an appraisal completed January 2009 with an estimated market value of \$665,000.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. The appraisal and sales of comparable properties were considered. The Board looked closely at neighboring land values. Jane Sparks made a motion to change the land adjustment from E-35 to E-40. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Nancy Mueller 704493

Ms. Mueller appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of her property located at 409 Moonridge Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$284,636. The property is a 4 acre tract improved with an 1834 square foot residence. Documentation included listings of properties in the neighborhood and photographs of a neighboring tract at 308 Old School Road that has junked cars and debris in the yard.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jerry Kruter made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Nancy Mueller 707319

Ms. Mueller appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of a 4.3 unimproved tract of land located adjacent to her primary residence at 409 Moonridge Rd., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$142,611. Documentation included listings of properties in the neighborhood and photographs of a neighboring tract at 308 Old School Road that has junked cars and debris in the yard.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jerry Kruter made a motion that no change be made to the valuation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Mary Pixley 401562

Ms. Pixley appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of an unimproved lot located on St. Mary's Road, Orange County, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$17,243. Documentation included a letter from the Orange County Health Department noting that the lot does not perc and is not suitable for building.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jerry Kruter made a motion to change the land adjustment from A-75 to A-85 due to the fact it will not perc. Jane Sparks seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Colonial Inn LLC 400523

Mr. Francis Henry appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of the Colonial Inn property located at 153 W. King St., Hillsborough, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$658,930. Mr. Henry's documentation included a page from a current appraisal noting a value of \$410,000. Mr. Henry has been in the process of renovating the Colonial Inn property for several years and feels the valuation is excessive due to the current condition of the property.

Mr. Henry appeared before the Board without a scheduled appointment and a copy of the full appraisal was not available for review by the Board. Jane Sparks made a motion to table this property and directed county staff to obtain a copy of the full appraisal, review the report, and make a recommendation to the Board for final deliberation. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Dag Pavic 759008

Mr. Dag Pavic appeared before the Board to appeal the valuation of his property located at 301 New Parkside Dr., Chapel Hill, NC. The current tax value assigned to the property by Orange County is \$304,064. The property is a .23 acre lot improved with a 1942 square foot residence. Mr. Pavic purchased the property in 2003 for \$248,000. Documentation included listings of sold properties in the neighborhood and information regarding the Freedom House located at the rear of Mr. Pavic's home. Freedom House is a recovery house for individuals who have substance abuse issues. Per Mr. Pavic, Freedom House has gradually expanded their building footprint since he bought his property in 2003 and has recently built a three story building on the site. The appellant feels this is a detriment to his property and negatively impacts the value.

During deliberations the Board considered all information presented by the appellant. Sales of comparable properties were considered. Jane Sparks made a motion to add an economic adjustment of 5% for the proximity to the Freedom House. Barbara Levine seconded the motion and the motion carried.

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Douglas Behan 767367
Francis Chan 740017
Lorren Bryant 715011, 700613, 707618, 752932, 752931

The appellants listed above failed to appear before the Board. Since the appellants presented no evidence, Jane Sparks made a motion that no change be made to the value at this time and should any of these property owners request to reschedule, prior to Board adjournment, their case can be reconsidered at that time. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the motion carried

Ayes: 3
Noes: 0

Having heard all the appeals scheduled on this date, Jane Sparks made a motion to adjourn this meeting. Jerry Kruter seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 4:55 pm.



Jane Sparks, Chair



Pamela Bryant, Recording Secretary